Abstract
This study focuses on resolving the provenance issues of a collection of objects in the Phillips Museum of Art in Franklin and Marshall College that supposedly came from the Grape Tavern, one of the oldest taverns in the city of Lancaster, Pennsylvania. It includes an investigation of the history of the Grape Tavern and provenance research based on the donor's genealogy. This research draws almost exclusively on primary and archival sources, including Federal census records, family correspondence, diaries, records in the Lancaster Historical Society, County probate records and newspaper clippings. An investigation of the history of the Grape Tavern and of these objects' ownership reveals that the museum's collection likely contains objects from the Grape Tavern. This research highlights the historical and cultural value of these objects for the city of Lancaster.
Introduction

Donated to the Phillips Museum of Art in Franklin and Marshall College in 1995 by Sarah McIlvaine Muench (1909-2006), the Muench Collection features about 150 family heirlooms, consisting of paintings, photographs, and decorative arts, dating from the early nineteenth century to the late twentieth century. According to family lore, most of these objects belonged to or were used by Muench's ancestors, who started settling in Lancaster as early as 1710. The Muench Collection comprises a large portion of the museum's collection of the material culture of Lancaster, Pennsylvania. Another portion of the collection was accessioned by the Lancaster County Historical Society (now LancasterHistory.org). These objects also are important gateways for further inquiry into the cultural and social history of Lancaster.

The collection was significant enough to warrant conducting an oral history as an effort to capture what the family knew about these objects. In a two-hour interview with Sarah McIlvaine Muench conducted by David P. Schulyer in 1995, she identifies a silver-plate tea caddy, a vegetable bowl with lid, a covered butter dish with tray, a tall clock, a cradle, and a drop-leaf table as coming from one of the earliest taverns in downtown Lancaster, the Grape Tavern. The Tall Clock (Figure 1), dating back to 1818, has a scroll-pediment bonnet, a mahogany veneer scroll board, and colonnettes in front with brass capitals and bases. A marker mark "Martin Schreiner/LANCASTER/ No 247" was painted onto the dial above the center. The Drop-Leaf Table (Figure 2) has rectangular leaves with cusped corners and stands on four cabriole legs terminating in carved claw-and-ball feet. It is dated from 1760 to 1785. The other four objects, the cradle, tea caddy, vegetable bowl, and covered butter dish, are roughly dated to late nineteenth century, 1850-1900. The Cradle (Figure 3), made of walnut and pine, is in

---

1 Interview with Sarah McIlvaine Muench by David P. Schulyer on August 2-3, 1995. The CD-ROM is preserved in the Franklin and Marshall College Archives and Special Collections.
rectangular shape with dovetailed sides canted outward. Muench explained in the interview that
the cradle was used in the Grape Tavern and General Porter was rocked in it. The Silver-plate
Tea Caddy (Figure 4) is engraved "Michael's House" on the side and marked "F.D.W. Furniss
Tripple Plate Philada" on the base. The Vegetable Bowl with lid (Figure 5) is an oval glass bowl
engraved with a repeating pattern of grapes, leaves and vines. Under its lid, "113/132" is etched.
The last piece of these objects is the Covered Butter Dish and Tray (Figure 6). The circular dish
has a domed cover with a chrysanthemum with leaves and a stem makes up the finial. Muench
said this butter dish was used in the Grape to serve butter, and one could put the ice in the bottom
to keep butter cool.

However, Muench did not elaborate further on these objects. Our current knowledge
about them and their history are limited to her brief description in the interview. Because these
objects are dated to a wide range of time, from the late eighteenth century to the late nineteenth
century, their authenticity are brought into question. When was the tavern built and suspended?
Were these objected actually used by or displayed in the tavern? How did they later come into
the donor's possession?

The objectives of this study are twofold. The first is to expand our knowledge concerning
the historical context of these objects through investigating the history of the Grape Tavern itself.
The second is to reassess the 1995 oral history—the sole basis on which the identity of these
objects rests—and verify the authenticity of these putative Grape Tavern objects through more
extensive provenance research. This type of research traces the history of the ownership of
objects over time, in the effort to establish their place of origin. In some ways, provenance

---

2 Interview with Sarah Mcilvaine Muench on August 3, 1995, conducted by David P. Schulyer, 1995, CD-ROM. It is unclear who General Porter is. He could possibly be Andrew Porter (1820-1872), a Lancaster native who later served in the union Army during the American Civil War.

3 Interview with Sarah Mcilvaine Muench on August 3, 1995, conducted by David P. Schulyer, 1995, CD-ROM.
research is like genealogical research, providing contextual and circumstantial evidence for the original production of an artifact, evidence that illuminates its current existence. This study mainly consults the archival sources in the Franklin and Marshall College Archives and Special Collections and the Lancaster Historical Society. The Sarah McIlvaine Muench Family Papers in the Special Collections of Franklin and Marshall College consist of a wide range of documents of the donor's ancestors and family, including genealogical information, correspondence, diaries of family members, and so on. The historical documents on the Grape Tavern and the early tavern history in the Lancaster Historical Society also yield valuable information to the study.

This study is still in progress. For now, the history of the Grape Tavern is unraveled, and genealogical evidence for Sarah McIlvaine Muench suggests a strong likelihood that these objects were inherited from the donor's ancestors. The genealogical tree also suggests the donor is directly related to the owners of the Grape Tavern, the Michael Family. However, there is no significant evidence directly suggesting these objects were owned by the Michael Family or used in the Grape Tavern. Because many critical documents are still missing, it has not yet been possible to establish complete provenance records for these objects. However, it still seems very plausible to speculate that Muench inherited these objects from the Grape Tavern from her ancestors. Further object research is needed to verify this hypothesis.

The History of the Grape Tavern

The Grape Tavern was historically located at 30-32 North Queen Street in downtown Lancaster. The site was used and operated as a tavern and later a hotel for nearly 150 years, from 1741 to 1912. The information concerning the ownership of the site prior to 1819 primarily relies on the documentation published in the "Journal of Lancaster County Historical Society" and
reports of the history of the tavern found in newspaper clips from the 1990s. However, the information might not be completely accurate because most of existing documents do not specify the sources they consulted. Nonetheless, these documents still provide information sufficient for us to catch a glimpse of the early history of the tavern.

John Harris, the builder and the first owner of the Grape Tavern, obtained a tavern license in 1741. In 1769, the tavern was sold at a sheriff sale to Col. Adam Reigart. It was well-known as the "Grape" at this time, because the sign hanging over the front entrance featured a bunch of grapes. During the Revolutionary War, the Grape Tavern was served as headquarters for all gatherings and organizations. Reigart later sold the tavern to man called John Michael in 1794. After his death in 1821, John Michael passed the tavern business to his son John Michael, Jr., who had taken charge of the finances of the business as early as 1819. During John Michael, Jr.'s time, the tavern was also known as the "Grape Hotel" and "Michael's House." After John Michael, Jr.'s death in 1867, the ownership of the tavern transferred to his wife, Elizabeth Michael. She continued the hotel business after her husband's death until 1876.

After 1876, the information regarding the ownership of this site is fragmentary and incomplete. The proprietors of this site changed very frequently, almost every two years. The Grape Hotel was owned by Silas Wright (1875-1876), Jacob Stoott (1877-1878), W. B. Finney (1882-1883), Henry Rahter (1884-1885), and David Mingle (1886-1888). The identities of the

---

4 The *Journal of Lancaster County Historical Society*, vol.30, 1930, 75-79.
6 The *Journal of Lancaster County Historical Society*, vol. 68, 1964, 11.
8 In the Lancaster City Directories from 1871 to 1876, Elizabeth Michael's name appeared as the proprietor of the Grape Hotel, and the 1870 U.S. Census indicates that her occupation as "hotel keeper" in that year.
9 The Lancaster City Directory of 1876-1877 shows that the Michael family's address was changed to "50 Duke Street" and that the proprietor of the Grape Hotel changed to Silas Wright.
10 Information based on Lancaster City Directory, 1844-1900 in the Lancaster Historical Society.
http://digitalcollections.powerlibrary.org/cdm/landingpage/collection/schs-cd01
proprietors of the Grape Hotel from 1888-1900 are not clear because there is no information about them recorded in the city directories from that period of time.

In 1901, the Grape Hotel was renamed as "American House."\textsuperscript{11} This site remained as the American House from 1901 to 1912.\textsuperscript{12} Its proprietor was recorded as "Heist and Carman (Stuart H. Heist and George W. Carmen)" in 1901. In 1905, the owner was recorded as A. D. Lyne. The last owner of the site was Samuel Hertzler in 1912. Since then, there is no record related to the "Grape Hotel," "American House," or "30-32 N Queen Street" in the city directory.\textsuperscript{13} Therefore, 30-32 N Queen Street, the site of the old Grape Tavern, was last used as a hotel in the year of 1912.

The Grape Tavern was historically and culturally important to the history of Lancaster. In terms of its founding date, it is almost as old as the city. As a public space with a 150-year history, the form and function of the Grape Tavern is also intertwined with the city's history and its dramatic change from a colonial to a modern town. The Grape Hotel itself also transformed from an old day tavern to a hotel, corresponding to the political, cultural, and economic changes of Lancaster. Although the Grape Tavern no longer exists, the objects from the tavern remain as an important piece of the material cultural heritage of the site. The collection of the Grape Tavern objects donated by Sarah McIlvaine Muchen in the Phillips Museum of Art roughly dates from the early nineteenth century to the late nineteenth century, when the Michael family was in the Grape Tavern. If they are proved to be from the Grape Tavern, they can be further studied within this historical and cultural context. The next step to be taken is the provenance research of these objects, to confirm their authenticity.

\textsuperscript{11} "The Grape Hotel" or "The Grape Tavern" was not found in the Lancaster City Directory after 1900. Instead, the business name for 30-32 N Queen Street appears as "American House" under the Hotel Category.
\textsuperscript{12} Information based on \textit{Lancaster City Directory, 1901-1914} in the Lancaster Historical Society. http://digitalcollections.powerlibrary.org/cdm/landingpage/collection/slchs-cd02
\textsuperscript{13} Information based on \textit{Lancaster City Directory, 19/4-1922} in the Lancaster Historical Society. http://digitalcollections.powerlibrary.org/cdm/landingpage/collection/slchs-cd03
From the Grape\textsuperscript{14} to Family Possession

According to the family lore, these objects were inherited by Sarah McLlvaine Muench from her family ancestors. Therefore, I hypothesized that they belonged to one of the owners of the Grape, who was the ancestor of or related to Sarah McLlvaine Muench's family. With that in mind, and I then investigated Muench's genealogy, focusing on the available archival records to see if there is enough evidence to support this hypothesis.

The genealogy research indicates Sarah McLlvaine Muench was directly related to the Michael Family, the owner of the Grape from 1794 to 1867. A genealogy fan chart in the Franklin and Marshall College Archives and Special Collections maps the ancestors who are directly related to Sarah McLlvaine Muench from both her maternal and paternal sides. It shows that John Michael, Jr. is the great-great-great grandfather of Sarah McLlvaine Muench on her maternal side. Besides, the Michael Family Tree (Chart 1)-based on death records, U.S. census records, information collected by previous researchers in the Franklin and Marshall College Archives, and a genealogy finding report ordered by Sarah McLlvaine Muench herself also maps a direct lineage relationship between Sarah McLlvaine Muench and the Michael family.

\textsuperscript{14}Because the name of the tavern was changed a number of times, in order to avoid confusion, "the Grape" will hereafter be used to refer to the site.
Chart I. Michael Family Tree. Reconstruction by Chechen Qu

This Michael family tree also illuminates the likelihood of these Grape Tavern objects coming into Sarah Mcilvaine Muench's possession. After John Michael, Jr.'s death in 1867, he left the tavern and estates to his wife, Elizabeth Michael (maiden name: Elizabeth Dietrich). In 1876, Elizabeth Michael sold and moved out from the Grape. Because this site was still used as a hotel after 1876, it is very likely that Elizabeth Michael sold the property with all its hotel furnishings. The Lancaster City Directory in 1847 shows that she moved to 50 N. Duke Street.

15 In John Michael's will (Pennsylvania Wills and Probate Records, 1683-1993, Book Z, Page 161) made on December 19, 1855, he wrote, "I give and bequeath unto my wife Elizabeth Michael, all my estate real and personal of whatever estate, I may have at my death to her own use towards she paying on guarantee the payment of all my joint and legal indebtedness ... I do hereby nominate and appoint my wife Elizabeth Michael executor of my last will and testament."
after she sold the Grape. She might have kept the private furnishings and some valuable pieces with her.  

Upon Elizabeth Michael's death in 1889, she ordered her friend, Charles M. Howell, as executor of her will, to convert all of her property into money and divided it into five equal shares for the children of her three deceased sons and daughter and two of her surviving children, Webb Michael and Sarah Cox (maiden name: Sarah Ann Michael). In the will, Elizabeth Michael did not mention any specific gifts. It is now unclear whether her furnishings were sold or preserved by her family members. If some pieces of her furnishings were preserved, her two living children, Sarah Cox and Webb Michael, would have been the most rightful candidates.

Of the two children, Sarah Cox seems more likely to have had the chance to handle her deceased mother's belongings. In 1880, after Elizabeth Michael moved out from the Grape, she lived at 50 N. Duke Street in Lancaster. The 1880 U.S. Federal Census records show that Sarah Cox, who was already a widow at the time, also lived at the same address with her son, Walter Cox. She was arguably the closest relative to Sarah Cox. There is no evidence indicating how close Webb Michael was to his mother and where he resided after the family moved out from the Grape in 1876.

It is equally likely that some of Elizabeth Michael's personal belongings were directly passed to Ida Cox, daughter of Sarah Ann Cox. Sarah Cox rented an apartment on 50 E. Orange Street and lived by herself after her mother's death. It would have been quite impossible for her to live in an apartment with large furniture. Her only living child after the death of Elizabeth

---

16 The U.S. Federal Census in 1860 suggests she resided in the Grape with her family.
18 The 1900 and 1910 U.S. Federal Census shows the address of Sarah Ann Cox was on 50 E. Orange Street, where she lived with people with different surnames. Her relationship to the head of the household was recorded as "roomer."
Michael was Ida Cox, who had already married Thomas Fordney in 1875. Ida Cox, who lived in a house in Manheim, Lancaster, would be more likely to house her deceased grandmother's personal belongings. Ida Cox's diaries from 1904-1914 indicate that she visited her mother, Sarah Cox, almost every week. This shows that she must have been very close to her.

Ida Cox died in 1932. According to her husband Thomas Fordney's will made in 1933, all their estates and remaining properties were sold immediately after their death. However, Ida Cox also left a will in which she listed specific gifts to her children. She gave the "grandfather clock, antique tea spoon, and drop-leaf table with claw feet" to her son William Fordney, and the "Chippendale chair" to her daughter Alice Fordney. William Fordney died in 1948, and the "grandfather clock" and other objects that he supposedly inherited from his mother do not appear in his probate records in the Lancaster County archives. However, the clock came to the processions of his sister, Alice Fordney, and appears in her will. She was the person who filed William Fordney's death, so she might also be the person who arranged and handled his properties. Because William Fordney never married and Alice Fordney is his only sibling who lived in Lancaster, it is very likely that Alice Fordney took the clock from her brother's house after his death. Later Alice Fordney gave the clock to her niece, Alice McIlvaine, sister of Sarah McIlvaine Muench. After Alice McIlvaine's death in 1989, she possibly gave these family inheritances from her aunt to her sister Sarah McIlvaine Muench, who donated these objects to the museum of Franklin and Marshall College.

---

20 "My Will," Ida Ma1y Cox, Franklin and Marshall Special Collections and Archives, Sarah McIlvaine Family Papers, MS44, Box I I, Folder 46.
21 Inventory of William Fordney, inventory Book 1729-1876, Book T, vol. 2, p. 13. Only the stocks and bonds held by William Fordney were listed.
Conclusion

This study has surveyed the history of the Grape Tavern and illuminated a possible provenance of the objects which supposedly came from the tavern. The Grape has over 150 years' history in the city of Lancaster. It was operated as a tavern and later a hotel from 1741 to 1912. Sarah McIlvaine Muench was directly related to the Michael Family, the owner of the Grape from 1794 to 1876. She appears to be the most rightful and reasonable Michael Family descendant to inherit the family heirlooms based on genealogical and archival research. It is also very likely that the "grandfather clock" and the "drop-leaf table with claw feet" named in Ida Cox's will are the Tall Clock and the Drop-Leaf Table in the museum. The Tall Clock in the museum is also identified as a grandfather clock, a typology of a longcase clock made in nineteenth century. The Drop-Leaf Table in the museum has claw-and-ball feet, matching with the description of the table in Ida Cox's will.

Current research also Archival records suggest the Tall Clock and the Drop-Leaf Table may once belong to Ida Cox, William Fordney, Alice Fordney, Alice McIlvaine, and Sarah McIlvaine Muench. The provenance for other objects, including three pieces of silverware and a cradle, are still unclear. Based on logical deduction, they could have belonged to John Michael, Jr. and his wife, Elizabeth Michael, and later inherited by their descendants. However, there is no sufficient evidence to show these objects' ownership prior to Ida Cox. Now we cannot conclude whether these objects were from the Grape Tavern. Further research is needed in order to establish accurate and reliable records for these objects. The next stage of this study will involve object research, closely examining the style, function, and makers of these objects in the museum to see how likely they were owned and used in an eighteenth-century tavern.
Illustration


Figure 2. Unknown Maker. Drop-Leaf Table, 1760–1785. Mahogany, oak, tulip poplar, 29 x 48 ½ x 16 ½ in, each leaf is 17 ¼ in. Phillips Museum of Art. Lancaster, Pennsylvania. Donated by Sarah Ellmaker McIlvaine Muench, John Benjamin McIlvaine and Alice Fordney McIlvaine Gibbons in memory of their family ancestry. M.VIII.1.


Bibliography


Lancaster City Directories. 1843-1900. in Lancaster County Historical Society. Lancaster, PA.

Lancaster City Directories. 1901-1922. in Lancaster County Historical Society. Lancaster, PA.

Lancaster County Will Book, 1730-1977. Lancaster County Archives. Lancaster, PA.

Lancaster County Inventory Book, 1730-1977. Lancaster County Archives. Lancaster, PA.


Sarah Mcilvaine Muench Family Papers. MS 44. Archives and Special Collections. Franklin and Marshall College. Lancaster, PA.

